25



1	wait f	or you to finish your answer before asking	
2	anothe	r one so that the court reporter can get that	
3	down.	With others being on the phone today and	
4	making	objections, it will be a little more	
5	distra	cting I think so if they do make an objection,	08:54AM
6	wait u	ntil it's completed and then we'll go forward	
7	with y	our responses. All right?	
8	A	Okay.	
9	Q	We will take periodic breaks. At any time you	
10	feel l	ike you want to take a break and we haven't	08:54AM
11	taken	one, let me know and we'll do that. All	
12	right?		
13	A	Okay.	
14	Q	Tell the court where you reside.	
15	A	I live in West Lafayette, Indiana.	08:55AM
16	Q	And you're employed there; correct?	
17	A	I am employed at Purdue University.	
18	Q	Since you agreed to appear and testify, have	
19	you be	en contacted by any of the poultry integrator	
20	defend	ant lawyers in this case?	08:55AM
21	A	Yes. I got subpoena and a phone call from	
22	Robert	George and Michael	
23	Q	Bond?	
24	A	Bond, yes.	
25	Q	All right. When did that call occur; do you	08:55AM

1	rememb		
2	A	It occurred last week.	
3	Q	All right, and they called you?	
4	A	Yes.	
5	Q	And what did they say when they called you?	08:55AM
6	A	I guess the conversation was they wanted to	
7	know i	f I was a paid expert on this case and if I	
8	was go	oing to take any side and wanted to know what	
9	it was	going to be about.	
10	Q	And did you respond to their question whether	08:55AM
11	you we	ere a paid expert?	
12	A	Yes, I did respond to that question.	
13	Q	What was your response?	
14	A	I am not a paid expert.	
15	Q	All right. Did they ask you any other	08:56AM
16	questi	ons or make any other statements to you in	
17	that c	conversation?	
18	A	I recall I think one of the questions was if I	
19	unders	stood some of the comments I make could	
20	potent	cially determine the liability in this case.	08:56AM
21	Q	Did those statements to you make you feel	
22	uncomf	Fortable in any way?	
23	A	No, it did not.	
24	Q	Okay. Now, you and I have spoken before	
25	today;	is that correct?	08:56AM

			9
1	A	Yes.	
2	Q	One time at your office and one time in my	
3	office	yesterday; is that true?	
4	A	Yes.	
5	Q	All right. In those discussions, were you	08:56AM
6	asked	to say anything you could not believe was	
7	true?		
8		MS. LONGWELL: Object.	
9	A	No.	
10	Q	Has anyone for the State of Oklahoma or its	08:57AM
11	attorn	eys requested that you render an opinion in	
12	connec	tion with the facts in this case?	
13	A	No.	
14	Q	Have you seen the complaint filed by the State	
15	of Okl	ahoma against the poultry integrator	08:57AM
16	defend	ants in this case?	
17	A	No.	
18	Q	Do you know, in fact, who all the defendants	
19	are in	this case?	
20	A	No, I do not.	08:57AM
21	Q	You heard lawyers this morning announce for	
22	variou	s companies, did you not?	
23	A	Yes.	
24	Q	Other than that, have you heard the names of	
25	the de	fendants in this case?	08:57AM
	I		

TULSA FREELANCE REPORTERS 918-587-2878

1	A	No. This is the first time I heard some of	
2	those	names.	
3	Q	Do you know a gentleman by the name of Bernard	
4	Engel?		
5	A	I know him.	08:57AM
6	Q	How long have you known him?	
7	A	We have worked together for a little over two	
8	years	now, and I've known him for more than seven or	
9	eight	years.	
10	Q	All right, and where did you first meet him;	08:57AM
11	do you	recall?	
12	A	We first met in a conference, our professional	
13	Americ	can Society of Agricultural and Biological	
14	Engine	eering Conference.	
15	Q	All right. Have you looked at or read Dr.	08:58AM
16	Engel'	's expert report that he prepared for this	
17	case?		
18	A	I have not.	
19	Q	Have you looked at any parts of it?	
20	A	No.	08:58AM
21	Q	Have you discussed with Dr. Engel the nature	
22	and so	cope of his opinions contained in that report	
23	that h	he has prepared for this case?	
24	A	No, I have not.	
25	Q	Have you seen or read any of the expert	08:58AM
	i		

٠	•	ı	
ı			

1	zanart		
	_	s submitted by the defendants in this case?	
2	A	No.	
3	Q	Have you looked at any or read any reports	
4	submit	ted by other experts submitted by the State of	
5	Oklaho	oma in this case?	08:58AM
6	A	No.	
7	Q	Do you know the names of the experts used by	
8	the St	cate of Oklahoma in this case?	
9	A	I do not.	
10	Q	Do you know the names of the experts used by	08:58AM
11	the de	efendants in this case?	
12	A	I do not.	
13	Q	Have you been asked at any time to perform	
14	work i	for any expert who's identified himself to be	
15	an exp	pert in this case?	08:59AM
16	A	Can you ask that question again?	
17	Q	Have you been requested by any person	
18	identi	ifying themself to be an expert in this case to	
19	do woı	rk for them?	
20	A	No.	08:59AM
21	Q	Have you looked at or read any transcripts of	
22	eithe	r Dr. Engel or others in this case?	
23	A	No.	
24	Q	Have you been provided any data that was	
25	gathei	red by the State or people working on behalf of	08:59AM

TULSA FREELANCE REPORTERS 918-587-2878

			$\overline{}$
1	the Ob		
1		ate of Oklahoma in this case?	
2	A	No.	
3	Q	Have you been provided any data provided	
4	throug	h the defendants in this case?	
5	A	No.	08:59AM
6	Q	What, if any, encouragement or discouragement	
7	has Dr	. Engel provided to you for your testimony	
8	today,	if any?	
9	A	None.	
10	Q	Has Dr. Engel put any pressure on you to	08:59AM
11	testif	y?	
12	A	No, he has not. I don't see how he can put	
13	pressu	re. I'm a tenured professor at Purdue. So no	
14	one ca	n.	
15	Q	Have you been promised anything for your	09:00AM
16	testim	nony in this case?	
17	A	No.	
18	Q	Have your expenses been paid to come to Tulsa?	
19	A	Yes.	
20	Q	And what expenses were those?	09:00AM
21	A	Airfare and hotel.	
22	Q	All right. Have you, sir, in your	
23	profes	sional career at any time been requested	
24	direct	ly by any of the defendants in this case to	
25	perfor	m consulting work on their behalf?	MA00:00

TULSA FREELANCE REPORTERS 918-587-2878

-	
_	
-	-

1			
1	7	No.	
	A		
2	Q	Have you performed any consulting work for the	
3	State	of Oklahoma in the past?	
4	A	No.	
5	Q	Have you been retained to provide an opinion	09:00AM
6	about	the State of Oklahoma experts' opinions?	
7	A	No.	
8	Q	Have you been retained to consult with any of	
9	the S	tate's experts on any issue in this case?	
10	A	No.	09:01AM
11	Q	Have you been retained by anyone to provide	
12	opinio	ons as to the defendants' experts' opinions?	
13	A	No.	
14	Q	Other than coming to testify today in Tulsa,	
15	have	you been asked by me or others for the State of	09:01AM
16	Oklah	oma to do any work on this case?	
17	A	No.	
18	Q	Other than your coming today to testify, have	
19	you b	een asked by me or others for the State of	
20	Oklah	oma to form any opinions specifically in	09:01AM
21	conne	ction with this case?	
22	A	No.	
23	Q	Let's talk a little bit about you, Dr.	
24	Chaub	ey. I'm going to hand you what is Exhibit No.	
25	1. I	'll represent to you that this is a document	09:02AM

TULSA FREELANCE REPORTERS 918-587-2878

1	A	It was from University of Allahabad in India.	
2	Q	Now, you've obtained a masters degree also.	
3	It's i	n biological and agricultural engineering.	
4	Where	did you obtain that?	
5	A	At University of Arkansas.	09:03AM
6	Q	And what year was that?	
7	A	1994.	
8	Q	All right. Did you have a supervisor in your	
9	master	s thesis work at that university?	
10	A	Yes.	09:03AM
11	Q	Who was that?	
12	A	Dr. Dwayne Edwards.	
13	Q	Is he also known as D. R. Edwards?	
14	A	Yes.	
15	Q	All right. What was the thesis that you	09:04AM
16	genera	al subject matter of the thesis that you	
17	provid	ded for your masters?	
18	A	I investigated how filter strips or buffer	
19	strips	s can be used as a best management practice to	
20	filter	some of the water quality constituents from	09:04AM
21	land-a	applied poultry litter and swine manure.	
22	Q	All right. You then obtained a PhD. Where	
23	was th	nat obtained?	
24	A	Oklahoma State University.	
25	Q	And what was the degree obtained there?	09:04AM

TULSA FREELANCE REPORTERS 918-587-2878

			···
1	A	Biosystems engineering.	
2	Q	And what year was that degree obtained?	
3	A	1997.	
4	Q	Did you have a thesis captain or director in	
5	your w	work there?	09:04AM
6	A	Yes.	
7	Q	Who was that?	
8	A	It was Dr. C. T. Hahn.	
9	Q	What was the general subject of the thesis	
10	that y	you prepared for your doctorate?	09:05AM
11	A	It was in the area of hydrology and watershed	
12	modeli	ing. I investigated how different	
13	uncert	cainties relate to model inputs and parameters.	
14	Q	Okay. Let's talk a little bit about the	
15	awards	s and honors you have listed here. There are	09:05AM
16	severa	al, but are these all of the ones that you have	
17	obtair	ned?	
18	A	No. Actually, what I consider the most	
19	signif	ficant is not listed here.	
20	Q	What is the award or honor that is significant	09:05AM
21	to you	u that's not listed?	
22	A	It is New Holland Young Researcher Award. It	
23	is giv	ven by American Society of Agricultural and	
24	Biolog	gical Engineering to one researcher every year	
25	younge	er than 40 years old.	09:05AM

2	4
4	4

1		
1	Q All right. So the subwatershed, does it have	
2	a name?	
3	A Moores Creek watershed. It is also at times	
4	referred as Lincoln Lake watershed.	
5	Q All right. Has it ever been referred to as 09:11AM	
6	Muddy Fork; do you know?	
7	A It is part of the Muddy Fork watershed, yes.	
8	Q Okay. Let's talk a little bit about your	
9	employment history, if we can, sir. Starting with	
10	when you were still studying or tell me when was 09:11AM	
11	the first time that you took a paid position in or	
12	around your bachelors degree or after it, sometime	
13	in that starting time frame.	
14	A So in 1992 in January I started my masters	
15	degree at the University of Arkansas, and I was a 09:12AM	
16	half-time research assistant, working 20 hours a	
17	week on a research project.	
18	Q What was the nature of the project that you	
19	were working on there?	
20	A I was involved in looking at land application 09:12AM	
21	of poultry litter and swine manure and how that	
22	results in water quality, constituent transport in	
23	small controlled plots, and what different best	
24	management practices could be considered to minimize	
25	that impact. 09:12AM	

TULSA FREELANCE REPORTERS 918-587-2878

1.	Q With regard	to that work, did it include
2	bacteria transport	as part of those constituents?
3	A Yes, it did.	
4	Q All right, a	nd that period of time was from
5	what were the dates	of that work? 09:13AM
6	A So it went f	rom January 1992 to July 1994.
7	Q Okay. Did y	ou then obtain employment after
8	that work in July o	f '94?
9	A I started my	PhD in August of 1994 at Oklahoma
10	State University, a	nd I was a half-time research 09:13AM
11	assistant there, wo	rking 20 hours a week.
12	Q What kind of	work were you performing as a
13	half-time research	assistant?
14	A I was involv	ed in looking at hydrologic and
15	water quality model	s, how do they work in different 09:13AM
16	watersheds, how we	can improve them, how we can
17	reduce their uncert	ainty.
18	Q Did you meet	a gentleman by the name of Dr.
19	Storm while at OSU?	
20	A Dr. Daniel S	torm, yes. 09:13AM
21	Q And did he p	articipate in your PhD studies in
22	any way?	
23	A He was a mem	ber of my PhD committee.
24	Q After Octobe	r '97, did you have additional
25	employment?	09:14AM

TULSA FREELANCE REPORTERS 918-587-2878

1	A	Yes.	
2	Q	Tell us what that was.	
3	A	I was assistant research scientist at	
4	Univer	sity of Alabama from October 1997 until April	
5	2000.		09:14AM
6	Q	And what kind of work did you do as an	•
7	assist	ant research scientist there?	
8	A	I worked as a hydrologist and water quality	
9	modele	er, again, in general, looking at water	
10	respon	se to runoff, sediment, nutrients.	09:14AM
11	Q	Was that a full-time employment?	
12	A	That was a full-time employment.	
13	Q	After April 2000, did you secure employment	
14	elsewh	ere?	
15	A	I became assistant professor at University of	09:15AM
16	Arkans	as.	
17	Q	And what was the time frame that you were at	
18	Univer	esity of Arkansas?	
19	A	So from May 2000 until December 2006 I was	
20	there.		09:15AM
21	Q	All right, and did your position as an	
22	assist	ant professor change at any time during that	
23	period	1?	
24	A	In 2005 I became I got tenured and I was	
25	promot	ed to associate professor.	09:15AM

TULSA FREELANCE REPORTERS 918-587-2878

- 1			
1	Q All right. Where did you go after leaving		
2	University of Arkansas in December of '06?		
3	A So in January of 2007 I became associate		
4	professor at Purdue University.		
5	Q And were you hired there as a tenured 09:15AM		
6	professor?		
7	A No, I was not hired there as a tenured		
8	professor. I got tenure last year.		
9	Q You mentioned that you had done some work in		
10	the watershed of Indiana and then you've talked 09:16AM		
11	about the Illinois River watershed. Are there any		
12	other watersheds that you've had experience with		
13	besides those two? I say two. Let me back up. How		
14	many Indiana watersheds have you been involved with		
15	in doing your work or study? 09:16AM		
16	A At least half a dozen of Indiana watersheds		
17	I'm working on right now.		
18	Q Other than the Illinois River watershed, are		
19	there others in Arkansas that you've done work in?		
20	A I've worked in Beaver Lake watershed. I was 09:16AM		
21	involved in Eucha-Spavinaw watershed and a number of		
22	what I call priority watersheds in Arkansas.		
23	Q What kind of watersheds?		
24	A Priority watersheds.		
25	Q Priority watersheds, okay. Just briefly tell 09:17AM		

TULSA FREELANCE REPORTERS 918-587-2878

1	the court, if you would, what kind of areas of study
2	or investigation you were conducting in these
3	various watersheds; are they consistent with what
4	you've done in your degrees?
5	A Yes. They are all related to agricultural 09:17AM
6	watersheds and looking at different processes
7	related to hydrology and water quality, how do these
8	processes affect what gets transported from these
9	watersheds, how we can mathematically model them and
10	what kind of different management practices we can 09:17AM
11	evaluate to see what happens.
12	Q All right. How long now have you then I
13	want to speak now basically about the Illinois River
14	watershed or its subbasins. How long have you been
15	directly involved in studying or investigating that 09:18AM
16	watershed or its subbasins?
17	A My masters thesis was based on work in the
18	Illinois River watershed, and then when I came back
19	as a faculty in 2000, since then I have been
20	involved in a number of projects in the watershed. 09:18AM
21	Q All right. So some of that work was in the
22	early '90's and then again starting in around 2000?
23	A Yes.
24	Q All right. Did your work in the watershed
25	include what I called field work study? 09:18AM

TULSA FREELANCE REPORTERS 918-587-2878

1		MS. LONGWELL: Object, form.	
2	A	Yes.	
3	Q	Tell the court what field work study would be.	
4	A	Field work study would involve instrumenting,	
5	collec	ting data at the field scale and our	09:18AM
6	develo	ping mathematical models to investigate what	
7	happen	s in terms of hydrology and water quality at a	
8	scale	typical of a field.	
9	Q	Do you have experience in actually taking	
10	sample	s then while in the field?	09:19AM
11	A	I have done a lot of field experimentation and	
12	have b	een involved directly in collecting field	
13	data.		
14	Q	Has your experience involved setting up	
15	instru	mentation which would remotely or	09:19AM
16	automa	tically collect data also?	
17	A	Yes.	
18	Q	In your work in the Illinois River watershed,	
19	have y	ou relied solely on just the data that you've	
20	collec	ted or others under your supervision?	09:20AM
21	A	Ask that question again.	
22	Q	In your work in the Illinois River watershed,	
23	is tha	t work, and certainly the papers you've	
24	writte	n, relying solely on the data that you collect	
25	or wou	ld it include data from others?	09:20AM

TULSA FREELANCE REPORTERS 918-587-2878

1	A No. It does involve data and publications			
2	from others who have worked in the watershed.			
3	Q So you have read published literature that			
4	would have some impact on your study or			
5	investigation; is that correct? 09:20AM			
6	A Yes.			
7	Q Based on your experience, how would you			
8	characterize the volume of published literature and			
9	data that involves the Illinois River watershed?			
10	A It is, in my opinion, a very well studied 09:20AM			
11	watershed. Compared to lots of other watersheds			
12	that I have experienced or seen, it is a data-rich			
13	watershed.			
14	Q Do you know whether or not research and study			
15	is still ongoing with regard to the Illinois River 09:21AM			
16	watershed? By others first, let's ask that. Do you			
17	know if others are still doing studies in the			
18	Illinois River?			
19	A I don't know for sure. There was some studies			
20	going on when I left and was different assignment to 09:21AM			
21	Purdue, so I assume they are still continuing.			
22	Q Are you continuing to do any work in the			
23	Illinois River watershed?			
24	A Yes.			
25	Q And that area of work involves what? 09:21AM			

TULSA FREELANCE REPORTERS 918-587-2878

1	A I am funded by USDA to study in Lincoln Lake		
2	watershed different best management practices, how		
3	do they work, and some of the socio-economic factors		
4	associated with BMP adoption, implementation and		
5	maintenance. 09:22AM		
6	Q Do you have any estimate of how long that work		
7	is going to continue?		
8	A We are in fourth year of that project, so that		
9	will end in September of '09.		
10	Q All right. Tell me, what are some of the 09:22AM		
11	sources of data that you have reviewed either		
12	through literature or downloaded that became part of		
13	your study or your work or your experience?		
14	MS. LONGWELL: Object to form.		
15	A Besides my own data, I have worked with the 09:22AM		
16	data that have been collected by Arkansas Water		
17	Resources Center, Arkansas Natural Resources		
18	Commission and Arkansas Department of Environmental		
19	Quality. I have worked with some GIS data that have		
20	been compiled and are housed by Center For Advanced 09:23AM		
21	and Special Technology, which is part of University		
22	of Arkansas. So they come from a variety of		
23	sources.		
24	Q Is USGS also a source?		
25	A Yes, of course, USGS is also a source of that 09:23AM		

TULSA FREELANCE REPORTERS 918-587-2878

```
1
        IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE
2
                   NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA
3
4
     W. A. DREW EDMONDSON, in his )
     capacity as ATTORNEY GENERAL )
5
     OF THE STATE OF OKLAHOMA and )
6
     OKLAHOMA SECRETARY OF THE
     ENVIRONMENT C. MILES TOLBERT, )
7
     in his capacity as the
     TRUSTEE FOR NATURAL RESOURCES)
8
     FOR THE STATE OF OKLAHOMA,
9
                  Plaintiff,
                                    )4:05-CV-00329-TCK-SAJ
10
     VS.
11
     TYSON FOODS, INC., et al,
12
                  Defendants.
13
                       VOLUME II OF THE VIDEOTAPED
14
15
     DEPOSITION OF INDRAJEET CHAUBEY, PhD, produced
     as a witness on behalf of the Plaintiff in the above
16
17
     styled and numbered cause, taken on the 2nd day of
     March, 2009, in the City of Tulsa, County of Tulsa,
18
19
     State of Oklahoma, before me, Lisa A. Steinmeyer, a
20
     Certified Shorthand Reporter, duly certified under
     and by virtue of the laws of the State of Oklahoma.
21
22
23
24
25
```

TULSA FREELANCE REPORTERS 918-587-2878

INDRAJEET CHAUBEY, PhD, Volume II, 3-2-09

137

1	Q Okay. On Page 2 of your report at the top	
2	right-hand column it says, land use within the	
3	Illinois River watershed is approximately 58 percent	
4	pasture, 36 percent forest and 6 percent urban, and	
5	it cites Dr. Soerens in 2003. You've indicated	08:44AM
6	earlier in your testimony that you know Dr. Soerens;	
7	correct?	
8	A I know him.	
9	Q And did you read this study and do you agree	
10	with its conclusion?	08:44AM
11	A Yes.	
12	Q All right. Looking at Page 4, the lower	
13	right-hand corner, I want to talk a little bit about	
14	the runoff mechanisms that you actually dealt with.	
15	It says under that heading, runoff mechanisms on the	08:44AM
16	plots, each runoff event was analyzed to quantify	
17	the occurrence of saturation excess versus	
18	infiltration excess runoff on each plot. So you	
19	were measuring two different processes; is that what	=
20	I understand?	08:44AM
21	MR. BOND: Object to the form.	
22	A We were measuring two different processes that	
23	result in runoff generation, and those two processes	
24	are described here.	
25	Q And I know they're detailedly (sic) described	08:45AM
i		

1	in your report, but tell the court generally what
2	are those two processes that you identified and
3	studied?
4	A So the two processes that result in runoff
5	generation, number one is infiltration excess 08:45AM
6	process, and number two is saturation excess
7	process. You want me to talk about those two
8	processes?
9	Q Yes, sir, I do. Just briefly tell us what
10	they are in the concept of what you were studying in 08:45AM
11	this study.
12	A So in order for runoff to be generated when
13	there is a rainfall happening, one of the two
14	conditions have to be met. Number one, the rate at
15	which rainfall is hitting the ground, there is 08:45AM
16	infiltration taking place, which takes some of that
17	rainwater inside the soil profile, and so if you
18	look at the infiltration rate, the rate at which
19	water is infiltrating, and then look at the rainfall
20	rate, when rainfall rate is greater than 08:46AM
21	infiltration rate, then runoff will occur on the
22	surface, and that process is called infiltration
23	excess runoff. It's not always needed for runoff to
24	take place. The other possibility could be that if
25	the water table beneath the soil surface is close to 08:46AM

INDRAJEET CHAUBEY, PhD, Volume II, 3-2-09

1	4	1
_	-	_

1	Q Okay, and there were others; correct?
2	A There are others, yes.
3	Q If we look at Page 14 at the summary and
4	conclusions of this paper, after it describes your
5	methodology, the second sentence of that from under 08:50AM
6	that heading it says, results from this study showed
7	that both infiltration excess and saturation excess
8	runoff processes occur on this hillslope. Based
9	upon the way you set this study up, would the
10	processes that you identified and quantified in this 08:50AM
11	study be found throughout the Illinois River
12	watershed in similar circumstances?
13	MR. BOND: Object to the form.
14	MR. FREEMAN: Object to form.
15	MS. HILL: Object to form. 08:50AM
16	MS. LONGWELL: Form.
17	A Yes, because we wanted it to be a
18	representative hillslope. So I think that this
19	conclusion will be applicable to the watershed.
20	Q Okay. Have you seen any other studies as 08:51AM
21	detailed with regard to the sensors used by you in
22	this study to measure runoff processes?
23	A There have been a number of studies to measure
24	runoff processes, not very many. There is actually
25	only one other group in the U. S. that has done 08:51AM